
APPLICATION NO.	P11/W0248 P11/W0249/LB
APPLICATION TYPE	FULL
REGISTERED	09.03.2011
PARISH	SOUTH MORETON
WARD MEMBER(S)	Mr L Docherty
APPLICANT	Mr & Mrs T Hedges
SITE	Willowbrooke House Mill Lane South Moreton
PROPOSAL	Small single storey kitchen extension to a Grade II Listed Building.
AMENDMENTS	None
GRID REFERENCE	456141188065
OFFICER	Mrs E Hamerton (W)

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 This planning and listed building application has been referred to the Committee at the request of the Local Member, who at the time of the request was Mr P Greene.

1.2 Willowbrooke House lies on the south eastern edge of South Moreton and is within the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty and the South Moreton Conservation area. The property is Grade II Listed and comprises a long linear section that has been constructed from a combination of materials including, brick, render and flint, under a plain clay tile roof. To the south end of this there is a largely brick built wing that has a higher ridge line. Adjoining this is a newly constructed two storey extension. To the east of the house is a large grassed area which wraps around to the south of the site. The front elevation of the house faces into a courtyard; however it is the rear elevation of the property that is most visible from the road and public view points within the area. **Attached** at appendix A is a copy of the OS location plan.

2.0 PROPOSAL

2.1 The application seeks planning permission and listed building consent to construct a single storey extension to the east elevation. The extension will be constructed with an oak frame with rendered panels under a tiled roof.

2.2 The proposed extension is 3.5m deep and 5m wide. It has a gabled roof with a ridge height of 5.6m. This extension will create a new kitchen area with a vaulted ceiling. A copy of the elevations and floor plans is **attached** at appendix B. Copies of the supporting information, including the Historic Assessment Report can be viewed on the Council's website, www.southoxon.gov.uk.

3.0 CONSULTATIONS & REPRESENTATIONS

3.1 These consultation comments apply to both the planning and listed building application.

South Moreton Parish Council

- No strong views
- There are no objections to this application and the Parish Council are not aware of any adverse comments from parishioners, therefore content for SODC to determine the application as it considers appropriate

3.2 County Archaeological Services

- No comment

3.3 Conservation Officer

- Objection
- The Historic Assessment Report states that the area where the extension is proposed is the earliest part of the listed building and that the east wall is likely to be the original external wall.
- The east elevation is characterised by a long elevation that is uninterrupted by any projecting elements demonstrating the linear development of the main house and associated outbuildings.
- Although the evidence of the fabric and documentary evidence suggests that a structure may have once projected from Block B, it seems unlikely that this was a substantial structure and at best was a simple lean-to building and temporary in nature.
- In my opinion there is insufficient evidence for a historic structure of permanent nature in the proposed location. The east elevation has a strong linear emphasis that is a significant element of the character of the listed building.
- The proposal would project from the east elevation and would mask this earliest element of the existing timber frame thereby interrupting the rhythm of the existing elevation. The proposed extension would also alter the simple vernacular form of the building by projecting into the garden. The proposed extension is therefore considered to be contrary to CON2 and CON 3 of SOLP and PPS5.

4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

4.1 P10/W1200/LB – Two storey extension – Listed building consent October 2010

P10/W1199 – Two storey extension – Planning permission October 2010

P09/W0627/LB – Erection of single storey rear conservatory – withdrawn November 2009

5.0 POLICY & GUIDANCE

5.1 Adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011

- G6 Promoting good design
- C2 Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty
- CON2 Alterations and extensions to listed buildings
- CON3 Alterations and extensions to listed buildings
- CON5 The setting of listed buildings
- CON7 Proposals affecting a conservation area
- CON13 Archaeological and historic building analysis recording
- H13 Extensions to dwellings

South Oxfordshire Design Guide

Planning Policy Statement 15 – Planning for the Historic Environment

6.0 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

6.1 For the purposes of this report the considerations in determining the planning application and listed building consent have been dealt with together. However in determining the listed building consent the only relevant consideration is the impact of the proposal on the historic fabric and character of the building.

6.2 The relevant points to consider when determining these applications are:

- The impact of the proposal upon the established character and special historical and architectural features of the building
- The impact of the development on the character and appearance of the South Moreton Conservation Area
- The impact of the development on the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty
- Impact on nearby neighbours
- Archaeology

The impact of the proposal upon the established character and special historical and architectural features of the building.

6.3 Willowbrooke House is Grade II Listed. The east elevation is characterised by a long elevation that is uninterrupted by any projecting elements demonstrating the linear development of the main house and associated outbuildings. On the west elevation there is a sharp contrast to this simple linear form, with a taller and shorter wing. Planning permission was granted last year for a two storey extension to this wing in order to create two additional bedrooms and bathroom at first floor and a new dining room, boot room and study at ground floor. Therefore this property has already benefited from a sizeable extension. However this was considered to be acceptable as it was the least sensitive elevation and is the most traditional way of extending this property to close off the existing courtyard.

6.4 The applicants submitted a Historic Assessment Report in support of this application. This report states that the eastern wall of the long wing is likely to be the original external wall. The modern fabric at ground floor level, where the extension is proposed may represent the presence of a lean –to type structure in this location previously. Therefore the applicant's case is that historically the building has had some form of extension on the east elevation which is the reason why this current application to create a kitchen extension should be allowed.

6.5 However, the Conservation Officer considers that there is insufficient evidence of a historic extension of permanent nature in this location. The east elevation has a strong linear emphasis that is a significant element of the character of the listed building. The timber frame on the east elevation is the earliest element of the house and although truncated at ground floor it is a significant element of the existing east elevation. The proposed extension would project from the east elevation and the gable roof would mask this earliest element of the existing timber frame, therefore interrupting the rhythm of the existing elevation which would be detrimental to the established character, special historical and architectural features of the building, contrary to policies CON2 and CON3 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan and advice set out in PPS15.

The impact of the development on the character and appearance of the South Moreton Conservation Area

6.6 The front elevation of Willowbrooke House faces into a courtyard. The courtyard is enclosed by double gates and a wall therefore from public view points within the Conservation Area this elevation is not clearly visible. However the east elevation which faces the High Street is visible and there are clear views of the property from a number of public view points within the Conservation Area.

6.7 Given the important historic character of this elevation of the building and its prominence within the Conservation Area, this extension would harm the character

and appearance of the Conservation Area by introducing a discordant feature to the building. This would be contrary to Policy CON7 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan and advice set out in PPS15.

The impact of the development on the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty

- 6.8 The primary aim of the North Wessex Downs AONB is to conserve and enhance the natural beauty, special landscape quality and distinctiveness of the area. Development that would harm the beauty or distinctiveness of the area will not be permitted. Although there are concerns that the extension would be detrimental to the listed building, as this property lies within the built up confines of the village, this extension would not be out of keeping with the character of the area or be of a scale and size that would be detrimental to the area. For these reasons this development is not considered to be harmful to the AONB.

Impact on neighbours

- 6.9 Nearby to the house there are workshops and other residential properties. None of these would be affected by the proposed extension. Therefore this development would not be detrimental to the amenity of nearby neighbours.

Archaeology

- 6.10 The Archaeologist at Oxfordshire County Council has not raised any objection to this proposal.

7.0 CONCLUSION

- 7.1 These applications to extend the property are recommended for refusal as the proposed extension would have a detrimental impact on the established character and special architectural features of the listed building which in turn would be harmful to the character and appearance of the South Moreton Conservation Area, contrary to development plan policies.

8.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 8.1 **That planning permission be refused for the following reasons:**

That, having regard to the linear form of the east elevation and its significant historical character and visibility within the South Moreton Conservation Area, this extension would be harmful to the simple vernacular form, setting and historic interest of the building and would be harmful to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, contrary to policies CON2, CON3, CON5 and CON7 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 and Planning Policy Statement 5.

- 8.2 **That listed building consent be refused for the following reasons:**

That, having regard to the linear form and setting of the east elevation and its significant historical character, this extension would be harmful to the simple vernacular form and historic interest of the building, contrary to policies CON2, CON3 and CON5 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 and Planning Policy Statement 5.

Author: Emily Hamerton
Contact No: 01491 823275
Email: planning.west@southoxon.gov.uk